

## COMPARE/CONTRAST ESSAY--ADULT REVIEW

Thesis Statement (*written neatly by student*): \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

1. **READ** Please read the student's essay from beginning to end. Remember that the purpose of the essay is for the student to identify and explain the most compelling similarities and/or differences between *The Giver* and the dystopian novel that he or she recently read and to use textual evidence to support his or her observations. Please note that at this point in the writing process the student should not have written a conclusion. While you read through the essay for the first time, do not make notes or corrections--just read through the entire piece for ideas and content.

2. **COMPLIMENT** Focusing on the ideas and content of the essay, write at least one thing you think the student did especially well:

3. **QUICK CHECK** Below you will find questions specific to the Compare/Contrast Essay you are reviewing. Please answer each question by checking either "yes" or "no." For each "no," use the back of this form to explain your observations and suggestions.

|    |  | YES | NO |
|----|--|-----|----|
| a. | Does the thesis statement, which is written above and should be included in the essay toward the end of the introductory paragraph, refer to the similarities and/or differences between <i>The Giver</i> and the dystopian novel? |     |    |
| b. | Does the organization of the essay follow the order in which similarities and/or differences are presented in the thesis statement?  |     |    |
| c. | Does the essay include at least three body paragraphs?   |     |    |
| d. | Do each of the body paragraphs address a distinct similarity or difference?  |     |    |
| e. | Can you find at least three (3) examples of textual evidence (quotes from the novels) in the body paragraphs?  |     |    |
| f. | Is at least one (1) piece of textual evidence from <i>The Giver</i> and at least one (1) from the dystopian novel?   |     |    |
| g. | Do all examples of textual evidence fit the purpose of the paragraph in which they are found?  |     |    |

4. **PROOFREAD** Please read through the essay one more time. This time pay close attention to the errors that are distracting or get in the way of fully understanding the student's writing. If the number of errors makes this task seem daunting, concentrate instead on the most frequent errors or the ones that are most troublesome for you as a reader. Indicate errors by circling the problem or make suggestions in the margins where appropriate.

5. **SHARE** Take a few moments to speak with the student about what you believe works well in the essay and what you feel should be his or her revision priorities. Encourage the student to come up with a plan for how to structure his or her in class writing time, i.e. how should he or she enhance content, improve organization, maximize the impact of quotes from each novel, and correct pesky grammatical and spelling errors?